Diversity and Recruitment Audit
Natural Resources Law Enforcement
AGA Joint Meeting with IIA
Ben Sutphin, OSIG Audit Manager
Camille Breland, OSIG Senior Auditor
February 18, 2021
AGENDA

• Why Did OSIG Perform This Audit?
• Getting Started
• Rolling Up Our Sleeves
• Digging In
• Reporting Out
• Challenges in Auditing Diversity
WHY DID OSIG PERFORM THIS AUDIT?

Requested by the Governor’s Office:

• Requested through Secretary of Natural Resources.

• Challenges in recruiting a diverse law enforcement workforce.
WHY DID OSIG PERFORM THIS AUDIT?

“I requested this audit in 2018 because of the obvious lack of diversity in these law enforcement agencies. We can expect to build a more inclusive Commonwealth and broader support for conservation only when our most visible environmental stewards look much more like the people they serve.”

- Governor Ralph Northam
GETTING STARTED

Initial Thoughts
• Not a traditional performance audit.
• We need expertise.

Outsource the Audit
• OSIG staff maxed out.
• Simplify gaining expertise.

False Start
• No response to outsourcing request
Manna from Heaven

- Camille wraps up a project and has availability.
- A recent report on government diversity including law enforcement was given to us.
ROLLING UP OUR SLEEVES

Dr. Kendra Smith
• Entrance Conference
  • Agencies provide OSIG with historical challenges faced by management when trying to recruit women and minorities.
  • Agencies request a law enforcement ride-along for the purpose of helping OSIG understand the unique duties of specialized law enforcement.
ROLLING UP OUR SLEEVES

• Identification of “other” in state law enforcement:
  • Virginia State Police.
  • Alcohol Beverage Control law enforcement.
• Identification of other states’ NRLE function:
  • Mississippi.***
  • North Carolina.
  • Maine.
• Identification of other federal natural resource law enforcement:
  • U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service.
ROLLING UP OUR SLEEVES

• Audit Team Goes On-site:
  • Lake Anna.
  • Douthat State Park.
  • Leeward Municipal Marina.

• Big Takeaways
  • Natural Resource Law Enforcement officers developed interest at an early age.
  • Previous law enforcement experience.
  • Job satisfaction.
  • Outreach and recruitment being done, but not to target audience.
# Rolling Up Our Sleeves

## Program Logic Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inputs</th>
<th>→</th>
<th>Processes</th>
<th>→</th>
<th>Outputs</th>
<th>→</th>
<th>Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hiring:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Job Announcement</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Posting of vacancy on state job website and outside sources</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Increase number of applicants</td>
<td></td>
<td>More diverse workforce and law enforcement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Application</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Screenings: Applicant physical and written assessments, medical/psychological exams, background checks, drug testing</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Increase number of qualified applicants</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Interviews</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Interview process</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Increase in women and minority applicants</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• HR Employees</td>
<td></td>
<td>o Interview panel selection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• HR Hiring Manager</td>
<td></td>
<td>o Development of interview questions and desired responses</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Funding</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Recruitment and outreach programs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• HR and law enforcement time to recruit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• HR and law enforcement travel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Audit Objectives

- Are strategies consistent with similar state level programs?
- Is pre-employment testing not a barrier to diversity?
- Are agencies analyzing incomplete testing for cause?
- Does recruitment process reflect true job requirements?
- Do agencies promote inclusive work environments?
- Do outreach programs reach all Virginians and promote interest in hunting, fishing and other outdoor activities?
Fieldwork Audit Program Highlights

• Data analysis of diversity in law enforcement.
• Recruitment methodology results.
• Comparison of Virginia NRLE recruiting methods:
  o Other Virginia state law enforcement.
  o Other states NRLE.
  o Federal NRLE.
NRLE Workforce Composition by Ethnicity for Fiscal Year 2018 Compared to Commonwealth of Virginia General Population

- **American Indian or Alaska Native (non-Hispanic or Latino):**
  - DWR: 0.60%
  - DCR: 0.00%
  - MRC: 0.00%
  - Virginia Population: 1.80%

- **Asian:***
  - DWR: 2.40%
  - DCR: 3.70%
  - MRC: 1.56%
  - Virginia Population: 6.90%

- **Black or African American (non-Hispanic or Latino):***
  - DWR: 0.00%
  - DCR: 0.00%
  - MRC: 0.00%
  - Virginia Population: 9.60%

- **Hispanic or Latino:***
  - DWR: 0.00%
  - DCR: 1.56%
  - MRC: 1.56%
  - Virginia Population: 19.90%

- **White (non-Hispanic or Latino):***
  - DWR: 0.00%
  - DCR: 0.00%
  - MRC: 6.90%
  - Virginia Population: 69.50%
NRLE Workforce Composition by Gender for Fiscal Year 2018 Compared To Commonwealth of Virginia General Population
Recruitment Methodology Results

- No collaborative recruitment between agencies.
- Each agency had a different approach.
- **Code of Virginia, § 29.1-200** disallowed the outside hiring of an individual to a non-entry level DWR law enforcement position.
- Lack of community engagement:
  - Outreach versus community engagement.
Results Highlights

- Electronic survey of all NRLE officers.
Have you ever attended diversity training in your current department, including initial training?

Responses

Yes (Please enter the name and date of the training below.)

No
The culture of my law enforcement department is receptive to all, including women.
The culture of my law enforcement department is receptive to all, including minorities.
The community I serve is receptive to all, including women conservation/marine police officers.
The community I serve is receptive to all, including minority conservation/marine police officers.
Law enforcement management supports an environment that is receptive to all, including women.
Law enforcement management supports an environment that is receptive to all, including minorities.
DIGGING IN

• Fieldwork Audit Program Highlights
  • Analysis of outreach programs:
    o Auditor attendance at outreach events.
    o Auditor attendance at educational events.
Result Highlights - Analysis of Outreach Programs

Auditor attendance at outreach events:
- No attendees at one Black History Month event.
- Little diversity at other events.
- Advertising was limited to agency websites.
- Attendees became interested in outdoors at a young age.
- Agencies rely heavily on events held by other organizations.

Auditor attendance at educational events:
- Need strategic community engagement in events.

One agency did not have any outreach or educational events planned.
What got you interested in hunting and fishing?

- Enjoy the Outdoors: 31
- Family: 65
- Friend of the Family: 19
- Live Near Natural Resource: 24
- Natural Resource Program: 5
How did you learn about this event?

- Attend Every Year: 34
- Family: 19
- Friend of Family: 11
- Other Reason: 20
- Social Media: 10
Interim Reports

- Planning results (Report 1).
- Results of three objectives (Report 2).
- Results of remaining objectives (Report 3).
- Reports were less formal but sent to Governor with copies to legislative committees.
- All three reports had 25 findings and recommendations.
Final Report Sections and Recommendations

- **A significant lack of diversity:**
  - Community Engagement Director.
  - Shared recruiter.

- **Lack of community engagement:**
  - Community Engagement Director.
  - New and better diversity resource development.

- **Need for D&I strategic plan improvements:**
  - New and better D&I strategic plans.
Final Report Sections and Recommendations

• Need for diversity focused recruitment:
  o Shared recruiter.
  o New and better D&I recruitment methods.

• Lack of effective diversity recruitment analysis:
  o Secretary of Natural Resources and Chief Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Officer involvement.

• www.osig.virginia.gov/reports/
Challenges in Auditing Diversity

- NRLE challenges apply to other professions.
- Challenge of diversity is not just about diversity. It encapsulates other factors such as leadership, culture and engagement.
- Unconscious bias in diversity:
  - Need for education in addition to change.
  - Ability to look from a different viewpoint.
- Unexpected written statements to survey.
CHALLENGES IN AUDITING DIVERSITY

• What would we do differently?
• Upcoming audit in other state functions.
ONE PICTURE SAYS IT ALL
QUESTIONS AND CONTACT INFORMATION

• Benjamin J. Sutphin, CIA, CPA, CISA, CIGA
  • OSIG Audit Manager
  • 540-378-5076
  • benjamin.sutphin@osig.virginia.gov

• Camille A. Breland, MAcc, CIGA
  • OSIG Senior Auditor
  • 804-418-4845
  • camille.breland@osig.virginia.gov